

Introduction

Provenance Research and Dialogue

Provenance Research and Dialogue

Claudia Andratschke and Lars Müller

Ethnographic collections and museums have been at the centre of public debate for several years now. In various European countries, new museum projects have acted as crystallisation points for the discussion – such as the establishment of the Humboldt Forum in Germany or the restructuring of the Africa Museum, Tervuren, in Belgium. From a scholarly point of view, restitution discourse has been stimulated by a new critical engagement with the colonial past and its aftermath, as well as by postcolonial studies, and more generally by strong activist voices in a number of European states. Together with firm demands for the restitution of artefacts and repatriation of human remains from former colonies, this debate has been closely linked to that around how to address the colonial past.¹

Provenance research has been an important aspect of such efforts. While dealing with the genesis or history of collections has always been a significant part of museum work, recent developments have fostered an intensive discussion on how the history of ownership, custody and translocation of objects has been shaped, from their production through their use to their later storage in museums.² Provenance research, whose focus in Germany after 1998 was predominantly on the identification of Nazi looted property, has increasingly turned to ethnographic collections from colonial contexts and opened up the debate to include collections of natural or archaeological specimens acquired in colonial contexts.³

This young and highly dynamic field of research has been further defined by numerous research projects, events and publications since the first conference, which explicitly addressed questions of provenance on colonial-era collections at the *Museum Fünf Kontinente* in Munich in 2017.⁴ After the 2018 “Restitution Report” by Felwine Sarr and Bénédicte Savoy for President Emmanuel Macron in France,⁵ an unprecedented public debate arose around ethnographic collections, which had a profound impact on the professional community. A working group at the German Museums Association wrote a “Guide to Dealing with Collections from Colonial Contexts”, for example, which was first published in 2018 and updated for the third time in 2021. In addition, the Federal Government Commissioner for Culture and Media (*Staatsministerin für Kultur und Medien*), the Minister of State at the Federal Foreign Office for International Cultural Policy (*Staatsministerin im Auswärtigen Amt für internationale Kulturpolitik*), the Cultural Affairs Ministers of the *Länder*, the *Länder* Senators for Cultural Affairs and representatives of the municipal umbrella organisations drew up first “Framework principles” in March 2019 as a political declaration of intent regarding collections from colonial contexts.⁶ In the same year, the German Cultural Council (*Deutscher Kulturrat*) published “Recommendations for Dealing with Collections from Colonial Contexts”,⁷ and the German Lost Art Foundation (*Deutsches Zentrum Kulturgutverluste*) expanded its funding lines to include colonial contexts. A “Contact Point for Collections from Colonial Contexts” was established to coordinate exchanges with the countries of origin as well as the initiated “3-road strategy” for the digitisation and transparent online presentation of ethnographic collections in Germany. A database was created on the Benin Bronzes held in museums in Germany, and these are now gradually being returned following the joint declaration on their restitution between the Federal Republic of Germany and the Federal Republic of Nigeria in 2022.⁸ And the portal *Collections from Colonial Contexts* was launched via the German Digital Library (*Deutsche Digitale Bibliothek*) in 2021, to be rendered multilingual by 2024.⁹

But it is not only in Germany that the debate has had a massive impact on the museum community. In the Netherlands, an “Advisory Committee on the National Policy Framework for Colonial Collections” was established in 2019, which presented its recommendations in 2021. In Belgium, an independent expert group presented “Ethical Principles for the Management and Restitution of Colonial Collections in Belgium” in 2021, and in Austria a panel of experts was established to develop recommendations for a legal framework for possible restitutions – just to name a few examples.¹⁰

In recent years, the discussion around the new research field of provenance research has been advanced through conferences, essays and books, and since 2022 the field has also had its own journal: *Transfer: Journal for Provenance Research and the History of Collections*.¹¹ The PAESE project (*Provenienzforschung in außereuropäischen Sammlungen und der Ethnologie in Niedersachsen/Provenance Research in Non-European Collections and Ethnology in Lower Saxony*), from which this volume has emerged, was located in this dynamic field; this book not only presents the initial research results of our subprojects and partners, but also aims to contribute to the further discourse.

Developing the PAESE Project

The Lower Saxony-wide PAESE project was actually planned before these most recent developments. When the founding of the Network for Provenance Research in Lower Saxony was initiated by the Ministry of Science and Culture in 2014/15,¹² there was no national funding for provenance research on collections from colonial contexts, so work on these could only be carried out on an ad-hoc or project-specific basis.¹³ Besides the Lower Saxony State Museum of Hanover, other members of the network with ethnographic collections, such as in Göttingen, Oldenburg, Hildesheim or Brunswick, also saw an urgent requirement for provenance research in this field.¹⁴ The need for *systematic* provenance research on collections from colonial contexts¹⁵ inspired the establishment of a joint project with the aim of conducting cooperative research on the origins of the five major ethnographic collections in Lower Saxony. PAESE was funded by the Volkswagen Foundation as of 2018, and this book represents the end of the project even if its work continues in a number of capacities.

The PAESE project was an interdisciplinary and multi-perspective collaboration, unique in this form so far,¹⁶ with a total of nine sub-projects at museums and universities in Lower Saxony: State Museum of Hanover, the Ethnographic Collection of the Georg August University of Göttingen, *Landesmuseum Natur und Mensch Oldenburg*, *Roemer- and Pelizaeus Museum Hildesheim*, Brunswick Municipal Museum, Evangelical Lutheran Mission in Hermannsburg, the Law Department of Leibniz University Hannover, and the History Department and Institute of Ethnology of the Georg August University of Göttingen.¹⁷

The objective of the project was, first, to conduct basic research on the origins of ethnographic collections in Lower Saxony; second, networking and cooperation with representatives of the countries or societies of origin as well as with comparable projects in the German-speaking and European regions; and third, to engage in transparency and dialogue regarding the origin of the objects and their future handling. From 2018 onwards, the project was able to establish cooperation with a number of institutions and individuals from the countries of origin.

None of our partners in Lower Saxony had collaborated on such a scale before and the network had to be built up from scratch. We encountered a diverse field – from museum organisations that already had experience in the field to those for whom this type of cooperation was new. In Namibia we worked with the National Museum and MAN (Museums Association of Namibia), in Cameroon with the *Musée Royale du Batoufam*, the *Université de Dschang*, and the Institute of Fine Arts of the University of Douala, in Tanzania with the National Museum and Fahari Yetu/Iringa Boma Museum and University of Iringa, in Papua New Guinea with the National Museum & Art Gallery, and in Australia with AIATSIS (Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies), the Central Land Council (CLC), and the Strehlow Research Centre. And we exchanged ideas with many more, both in the context of the overarching PAESE project and within its subprojects.



Figure 1 | Visit of N. M. Mubusisi, National Museum Namibia, to the *Roemer- and Pelizaeus Museum Hildesheim* (with A. Nicklich) © The Authors

Core Topics of PAESE

Basic Research

The selection of topics, regions and collections to be researched was based on the assessments of the respective partner institutions. The subprojects were planned mainly as PhD projects with a view to promoting the qualification of early-career scholars in this still largely unresearched field. We focused on various types of objects, regions and issues. The subprojects at the Municipal Museum Brunswick and the Lower Saxony State Museum Hanover focused on collections from Cameroon. Isabella Bozsa researched the (post)colonial acquisition histories and meanings of objects of Kurt Strümpell's Cameroon Collection from the German colonial period, and Bianca Baumann investigated the appropriation contexts of two collections (Wilko von Frese and Julius Konietzko).

At the University of Göttingen, Sara Müller's focus was on trade networks and routes in Papua New Guinea, while Hannah Stieglitz researched not only the provenance of objects from nowadays Tanzania but also their use in university collections and teaching.¹⁸ In 2020, Olaf Geerken, also at the University of Göttingen, began his subproject on *Provenances of Tjurunga*, researching the latter in the collections of the Evangelical-Lutheran Mission of Lower Saxony Hermannsburg, Hanover and Brunswick. At the *Landesmuseum Natur und Mensch* of Oldenburg, Jennifer Tadge focused on the collection of the Langheld brothers (especially their collection from Tanzania), including natural history specimens.¹⁹ Sabine Lang, at the *Roemer- and Pelizaeus-Museum Hildesheim*, researched several collectors' networks. And Christoph-Eric Mecke, from the History of Law department of the Leibniz University Hanover, did not research the provenance of a collection but inquired into legal-historical, juridical and legal-ethical perspectives on colonial collections.

Continuous interaction between the subprojects was facilitated – among others – by an academic coordinator at the Lower Saxony State Museum of Hanover; each year there were several meetings, workshops and PhD colloquia at the universities involved, held in Göttingen (History: Prof. Rebekka Habermas; Ethnology: Prof. Elfriede Hermann), Hanover (African History: Prof. Brigitte Reinwald; Law: Prof. Stephan Meder) and Oldenburg (History: Prof. Dagmar Freist) in which the progress of the PhD theses as well as the historical, ethnological and juridical methods used were discussed.

Exchange and Collaboration

A second aspect of provenance research on objects acquired in colonial contexts, *exchange and collaboration*, is one that the PAESE project considers crucial. The aim was not simply to increase the German museums' knowledge about the objects, but also to explore the objects collaboratively – within a given framework – and to initiate an open dialogue about them.

As early as 1997, James Clifford published his essay on “Museums as Contact Zones”, in which he describes how the museum can serve as a place where different actors and museum staff come together to engage in a dialogue about objects.²⁰ A few years later, Robin Boast critically examined this optimistic perspective, arguing that museums were originally colonial institutions and are still not neutral spaces of exchange. This neocolonial asymmetry must be reflected in any collaboration.²¹ While international collaboration for museums has been discussed for a number of years, the question of what collaboration might look like, especially for provenance research, is the subject of an intense debate.²²

The PAESE project has used these debates to reflect on its own work and also in an effort to engage in a dialogue around these issues. For example, at the beginning of the project, in 2019, we held a workshop in collaboration with the German Lost Art Foundation (*Deutsches Zentrum Kulturgutverluste*) on “Transnational Provenance Research in Ethnographic Collections”, to which we invited a number of projects currently working in the field in Germany. We were thus able to bring together actors from Cameroon, Gabon, Namibia, South Africa, Tanzania and Papua New Guinea, and representatives of collections in Basel, Berlin, Brunswick, Bremen, Göttingen, Hamburg, Hanover, Hildesheim, Lübeck, Oldenburg and Stuttgart (with the participation of the Federal States Working Group and the Ministry of Science and Culture in Lower Saxony, the Museums Association, the Network for Provenance Research in Lower Saxony, and the Working Group Colonial Provenances).²³ While this event was primarily an internal exchange within the museum community, we also placed value on actively contributing our experience to the research debate, for which the panel “Opportunities and Challenges of Cooperative Provenance Research” at the conference of the Association for African Studies in Germany (VAD) offered us the opportunity in 2021.²⁴



Figures 2 and 3 | Workshop "Perspectives of Transnational Provenance Research in Ethnographic Collections in Germany", PAESE in cooperation with the German Lost Art Foundation, 14–15 September 2019
© Lower Saxony State Museum Hanover (Photos: Kerstin Schmidt, Lars Müller)

Our cooperation rested on two pillars. First, on visits by partners from Cameroon (Albert Gouaffo, Richard T. Fossi, Paule-Clisthène Dassi, Rachel Mariembe, Hervé Youmbi, Tevodai Mambai, Ndzodo Awono, Prince Legrand de Bangoua Tchatchouang), Namibia (Nzila M. Libanda-Mubusisi, Werner Hillebrecht), Tanzania (Flower Manase, Jimson Sanga, Jan Küver), and Papua New Guinea (Tommy Y. Buga). Even when the COVID-19 pandemic severely restricted international travel, we were able to invite our partners to conduct joint collection surveys and discuss objects. The second pillar consisted of visits by our staff to Australia, Cameroon and Tanzania. Nevertheless, the pandemic still rendered some visits impossible.²⁵

We also felt a responsibility to contribute the project's findings to a broader public discourse and so also placed value on organising and participating in panel discussions. We also conducted interviews with Cameroonian students on objects kept in Europe and made these exchanges available online.²⁶ We also sought to contribute to the wider debates in the countries of our partners, especially in Cameroon, where two of our colleagues were carrying out their research.²⁷

We considered it important not to focus this work on the history of objects in general, and thus “merely” increase the knowledge of German museums about the objects in custody or work towards the returns of specific artefacts, but rather to initiate an open-ended dialogue. This open approach was and continues to be reflected in many ways in further activities. Opening up the collections via visits by our partners or transparent online inventories of the museums' holdings led to a more intensive discussion around restitution, for example, with consequential demands made to PAESE institutions for specific returns. The topic was debated following the visit of Werner Hillebrecht (Namibia) to the Municipal Museum Brunswick and is now likely to lead to the return of the belt of the freedom fighter Kahimemua Nahimemua.²⁸ In another case, Isabella Bozsa contacted the Bangwa community in Cameroon and the Royal Family of Fontem. Consultations with Chief Charles Taku and George Atem, both descendants of Fontem Asunganyi and Bangwa title holders, culminated in a visit by King Asabaton Fontem Njifua with a delegation to Brunswick and, shortly afterwards, a request for restitution.²⁹ The planned return of the belt (at the time of writing the final decision is pending), can thus be considered a direct output of practical provenance research and cooperation within the PAESE framework.

The PAESE Database – A Step towards More Transparency

One of the goals of the project was the transparent documentation of the researched holdings in a publicly accessible database.³⁰ As there was no comparable database of collections from colonial contexts available in Germany at the time, this was developed during the first two years of the project and made available online in 2020.³¹ Although digitisation projects in which a museum worked together with a specific community were already under way,³² the PAESE project planned a database that would be multiregional – and thus, in perspective, global –, open to natural history collections as well, and with a particular emphasis on the provenance data. This undertaking faced several challenges: five museum and university institutions fed data sets from different source databases (from different disciplines and institutional cultures, and thus with different recording standards, data fields, object, material and technical thesauri, etc.) into the PAESE database, continuously reflecting on questions of standardised documentation of metadata as well as the possibilities and limits of digital transparency in collections from colonial contexts.

The results were discussed at conferences and workshops. Designation and attribution became an area of crucial focus, including sensitivity to vocabularies and to the importance of avoiding images of sensitive objects. The new field of “cultural attribution” was established in order to critically address and find alternatives for previous attributions that had often been racist and misleadingly unambiguous, and first attempts were made to define methods or types of “acquisition” (not indicating a position, but a change of ownership) for objects from colonial contexts. All this work was always openly communicated; all decisions and terms are explained in an “Introduction to the Database” on the website.³³ Ultimately, the database brings together all relevant information from the basic data to the known or researched provenance, including scans of the inventory book entries, index cards or other relevant materials as well as transcripts. The focus is on documenting the provenance of the objects, indicating both known and unknown information, and the latter can be contextualised, discussed or problematised via free text fields.


SMBS_1709-0007-00		
Basisdaten	Dokumentation	Weiterführende Informationen
Inventarnummer	SMBS_1709-0007-00	
Alte Inventarnummer	A III c 438; Vw 1.4-44/1	
Standort	Städtisches Museum Braunschweig	
Objektbezeichnung	Elefantenmaske	
Indigene Bezeichnung		
Sammlungsort	Afrika, Kamerun, Südwestkamerun	
Material	Baumwolle Glas (Perle) Raphia	
Maße	B: 67 cm; L: 92 cm	
Beschriftung/Aufdruck/Etikett		
Teile	Einzelteil	
Technik		
Datierung	vor 1902	
Verknüpfte Person(en)/Institution(en)	Kurt Strümpell	
Konvolut	1. Konvolut Strümpell	
Objektart		
Typ	Ethnographica	
Kulturelle Zuschreibung	Bangwa	
Erweiterte Beschreibung	Maske des Elefantenbundes "aka". Dazu wurde vom Maskenträger ein langes, weites Gewand getragen. Roter, schwarzer und dunkelblauer Stoff, als Futter heller Faserstoff. Farben der Perlen: Weiß, Gelb, Blau, Türkis und Grün. Die Ohren sind unterschiedlich gestaltet, auf der Rückseite ohne Perlen. Die Perlenornamente auf der Vorder- und Rückseite des "Rüssels" sind unterschiedlich. Auf der Rückseite des Kopfteils ist ein Ring aus Textilien aufgenäht. Die Schreibweise der kulturellen Zuschreibung variiert in den Quellen; auf den alten Karteikarten im Museum wird überwiegend die Bezeichnung "Bangua" verwendet.	
Download: PDF		

Figure 4 | PAESE Database, Elephant mask, Municipal Museum Brunswick, inv. No. SMBS 1709-0007-00
© PAESE, The Authors

The aim was to be as transparent as possible, as a precondition for dialogue on the further handling of the objects. The exchange with experts from the countries of origin so far has already shown that there are more sensitive objects than expected and that a large percentage of object descriptions made by collectors or later by museum staff that are overly generalising, incomplete, erroneous or wilfully false.³⁴

The Conference

This volume compiles the contributions to the International Conference on *Provenance Research on Collections from Colonial Contexts: Principles, Approaches, Challenges*, which was held from 21 to 23 June 2021 at the Leibniz University Hannover in a hybrid format. The aim of the conference was to summarise what the project members and cooperation partners of PAESE had done over the three years, to situate the questions, methods, and preliminary results of the PAESE project within the field of provenance research on collections from colonial contexts, to discuss them publicly from various perspectives, and to give impetus for further discussion. The conference rationale was developed by the members of all PAESE sub-projects in collaboration with their cooperation partners from the countries of origin. In compiling the conference programme – and this volume – much importance was attached to the broadest possible methodological and thematic scope.



Figure 5 | The PAESE Conference, Closing Session © The Authors

The present volume continues this approach.³⁵ A core objective of the conference – as well as of this book – has been to hear the voices of our partners from the countries of origin. With this in mind, we were delighted that Syowia Kyambi agreed to deliver the keynote address. Equally, her contribution to this book not only provides valuable insight into her engagement with colonial contexts but also offers an artistic perspective on the topic.

The following eight chapters correspond with the panels of the conference, starting with contributions on methodological approaches of post-colonial provenance research (Section I). The second section addresses the collectors and trade networks that are the focus of many European projects conducting provenance research on collections from colonial contexts (Section II). And the following sections discuss the management and use of, and research on, objects in collections (Section III) and transdisciplinary approaches to provenance research (Section IV). One chapter explores the challenges and opportunities of restitution focussing on Namibia and Cameroon (Section V). Multiple perspectives were important in this panel as well as in the next chapter on cooperation projects between European and Cameroonian experts and scholars (Section VI). Section VII deals with the handling of sensitive Aboriginal collections from Australia in comparison with sensitive collections from Cameroon (Section VII). The last section, “Law vs. Justice”, presents legal-normative and moral-ethical approaches to the evaluation of colonial collecting from various international perspectives (Section VIII). Each chapter is introduced by the chair of the respective panel.

The cooperation partners of the PAESE project, as well as colleagues from other national and international museums and universities, were also involved in the planning and implementation of the conference. Through the cooperation between museums and universities in Lower Saxony and colleagues from the United Kingdom, the Netherlands, Canada and above all from Australia, Cameroon, Gabon, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Sri Lanka, Tanzania, Namibia and Uganda with different disciplinary backgrounds, the conference was able to establish an academic and multi-perspectival exchange. The equal space given to German/European scholars and experts from the regions or countries of origin, which had already been taken into account in the planning and was expressed in all the panels, was crucial here, as well as the diversity in gender and career status, ranging from representatives of societies of origin and activists to museum practitioners, and from PhD students to professors.

In line with the project’s rationale, Michael Kraus proposed placing the closing remarks in the hands of our cooperation partners from the countries

of origin. During this highly instructive session, they discussed the integration possibilities and the polyphony of sources, chances and limits of cooperation and their sustainability, to the future handling of objects and forms of restitution from their perspectives, and from historical, ethnological, regional and legal approaches. We are grateful that all participants of this discussion, Albert Gouaffo, Flower Manase, Tommy Y. Buga and Nzila M. Libanda-Mubusisi, submitted their statements to this volume and that the chair of this closing session, Richard Tsogang Fossi, provided a summary of the discussion (Section IX). This final discussion clearly shows that we do not yet have definitive answers to many of the questions that postcolonial provenance research has raised, and that dialogue between the various parties continues to be crucial. With the insights presented in this volume, we hope to contribute to the further discussion.

Both at the conference and while editing this book, we once again became aware of how the language we use shapes our work. We repeatedly found ourselves facing the challenge of finding a balance between language that on the one hand describes the historical conditions and, on the other, avoids perpetuating colonial or racist language and thus reproducing violence. We endeavoured to clearly mark problematic terms as source terms when their use could not be avoided for reasons of clarity or reference to former research. While the final decision was left up to the author in each case, we would like to express our sincere thanks to them for the instructive dialogue on these aspects, as well as to Wendy Anne Kopisch, who provided critical comments during the editorial process while proofreading several chapters.³⁶

Beyond PAESE

This volume marks the formal end of the PAESE project and of the funding period by the Volkswagen Foundation. However, in our institutions and beyond we have initiated discussions and projects that have deepened our questioning and carried our activities further. We were particularly surprised by the rapid developments in the area of databases. To ensure the continuation of the work beyond the funding period granted by the Volkswagen Foundation, the Network for Provenance Research in Lower Saxony has maintained the PAESE website and database since 2022 and has already taken up objects

for further research projects.³⁷ In this regard, the database has already paved the way for a research infrastructure in Lower Saxony from which projects at regional or municipal museums can draw, initiated thanks to national funding since 2019.³⁸

The PAESE database was also an important precondition for the nomination of the five PAESE institutions for their participation in the pilot phase of the “3-road strategy” of the federal and state governments by the Lower Saxony Ministry for Science and Culture mentioned above.³⁹ Furthermore, the PAESE facilities are thus among the 25 institutions that published records on the platform “Collections from Colonial Contexts” of the Digital Library in Germany in 2021, and who are now participating in various working groups preparing a new platform, scheduled to go online in 2024. At the same time, many of the discussions held among the PAESE network are now being continued at national and international level.

We are aware of the technical and financial framework conditions of the PAESE database as well as the fact that many other online databases but also other projects for the digital compilation of colonial holdings are under way. Collections from Kenya, Benin and Namibia with a regional focus have been published or will be published soon. The “Atlas of Absence” (*Atlas der Abwesenheit*) was recently made available and presents holdings from Cameroon in German collections, impressive both in terms of academic research and in its visualisation of the data.⁴⁰ The objective to present collections in a transparent way is also discussed and reflected in a number of guidelines and working papers that publish information about objects and collections in order to foster dialogue. The PAESE project has endeavoured to contribute meaningfully to this debate.⁴¹

Postcolonial provenance research is now firmly established in the PAESE institutions, and further joint applications are planned as the collections continue to work on other projects in this field. Hildesheim and Hanover are working on objects acquired in China, and a Lower Saxony-wide project on objects from the South Pacific is in the planning phase.⁴²

In other cases, the collaboration also had an impact on the exhibitions. Interventions were set up at the museum in Brunswick, for example, and the reorientation of the permanent exhibitions there and in Göttingen has been sustainably influenced by the project. New joint, temporary exhibitions have also been designed, for example via collaboration between the museum in Hildesheim and partners in Namibia, an exhibition of the Lower Saxony State Museum Hanover with the *Kamerunhaus*, Berlin or the revision of the

permanent exhibition under new collaborative aspects at the Municipal Museum in Brunswick.⁴³ We are particularly delighted that some of our partners from African countries and PNG have also established contacts with other German museums and that projects are continuing here. This supports our hopes that the PAESE project has provided incentives that will continue to have an effect even after its formal end.

Acknowledgements

Finally, we would like to thank all supporters, members and partners of the PAESE project; first of all, the Volkswagen Foundation and especially Adelheid Wessler for their support and generous funding, the Ministry of Science and Culture, Lower Saxony and the Network for Provenance Research in Lower Saxony for additional funding of the conference, support and continuation of the PAESE website and database, and the German Lost Art Foundation for their support and interest in the project from the very beginning. We are also grateful to all members of the PAESE project staff for their excellent work and support well beyond the planning and implementation of the conference: Bianca Baumann, Isabella Bozsa, Anna Marquez Garcia, Olaf Geerken, Sabine Lang, Christoph-Eric Mecke, Sara Müller, Hannah Stieglitz and Jennifer Tadge.

We further extend our warmest appreciation to all project leaders, directors, curators and professors involved in the PAESE project: Katja Lembke (Director, Lower Saxony State Museum of Hanover), Evelin Haase (Curator, Municipal Museum Brunswick and project leader until 2020), Rainer Hatoum (Curator, Provenance Researcher Municipal Museum Brunswick and project leader since 2020), Peter Joch (Director, Municipal Museum Brunswick), Michael Kraus (Curator, Ethnographic Collection, Georg August University of Göttingen and project leader), Andrea Nicklisch (Curator, RPM Hildesheim and project leader), Alexis von Poser (Curator, Lower Saxony State Museum of Hanover and project leader until 2019), Mareike Späth (Curator, Lower Saxony State Museum of Hanover and project leader since 2020), Regine Schulz (former Director of RPM), Ursula Warnke (Director, *Landesmuseum Natur und Mensch* Oldenburg and project leader), Dagmar Freist (Professor of Early Modern History, Carl-von-Ossietzky University Oldenburg), Rebekka

Habermas (Professor of Modern History, University Göttingen and project leader), Elfriede Hermann (Professor of Ethnology, University of Göttingen), Stephan Meder (Professor of Civil Law and Legal History, Leibniz University Hannover and project leader), Brigitte Reinwald (Professor of African History, Leibniz University Hannover), and Stefanie Michels (Professor of Global History, University of Düsseldorf). Many thanks to Maik Jachens for his support of the project, Jasmin Lasslop for her assistance with the conference organisation, and Ermisch Bureau for the book's design and layout.

Above all, we extend our deepest gratitude to our cooperation partners from the countries of origin, from Cameroon: Albert Gouaffo, University of Dschang; Richard Tsogang Fossi, University of Dschang/FU Berlin, Paule-Clisthène Dassi Koudjou, Chieftaincy Route programme; Rachel Mariembe, the Institute des Beaux-Arts of the University of Duala; Tevodai Mambai, University of Maroua; Victor B. Ngitir, University of Douala; Chief Charles Taku, Hervé Youmbi, Douala; Prince Legrand de Bangoua Tchatchouang, Kamerunhaus, Berlin; from Namibia: Nzila M. Libanda-Mubusisi, National Museum, Windhoek; Jeremy Silvester, Werner Hillebrecht, MAN (Museums Association of Namibia), Freddy Nguvauva; from Tanzania: Flower Manase, National Museum Dar es Salaam; Jimson Sanga, Deonis Mgumbaan, Jan Küver, Fahari Yetu, Iringa Boma Museum and University of Iringa; from Papua New Guinea: Tommy Y. Buga, Port Moresby National Museum and Art Gallery; and Australia: Michael Pickering, Australian National University; colleagues from the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies (AIATSIS), especially Iain Johnson and Shaun Angelis; the Central Land Council, Alice Springs; and the Strehlow Research Centre, Alice Springs.⁴⁴

We have exchanged ideas again and again in recent years with many other colleagues who are not mentioned by name here but whose input, interest and support helped shape the project and this book. To them too, we extend our sincerest thanks.



- 1 See Förster, Larissa; Eisenheiser, Iris (2019): "Zum Auftakt. Shifting Grounds", in: Edenheiser, Iris; Förster, Larissa (Eds): *Museumsethnologie. Eine Einführung. Theorien, Debatten, Praktiken*, Berlin, pp. 13–27. On the restitution debate see e.g. Habermas, Rebekka (2019): "Was verlieren wir, wenn wir restituieren? Von der Persistenz des Rettungsnarrativs", in: *Zeitschrift für Volkskunde* Vol. 115, no. 2, pp. 272–275; *ibid.* (2021): "Rettungsparadigma und Bewahrungsfetischismus. Oder was die Restitutionsdebatte mit der europäischen Moderne zu tun hat", in: Sandkühler, Thomas; Epple, Angelika; Zimmerer, Jürgen (Eds): *Geschichtskultur durch Restitution? Ein Kunst-Historikerstreit*, Wien et al., pp. 79–99; Laarmann, Mario; Ndé Fongang, Clément; Seemann, Carla; Vordermayer, Sarah (Eds) (2023): *Reparation, Restitution, and the Politics of Memory: Perspectives from Literary, Historical, and Cultural Studies*, Berlin/Boston. Morat, Daniel (2019): "Katalysator wider Willen. Das Humboldt Forum in Berlin und die deutsche Kolonialvergangenheit, in: *Zeithistorische Forschung*, Vol. 1, pp. 140–153. Addressing the colonial past also means reflecting on the various connections between regions of former colonisers and colonised peoples. See Michels, Stefanie; Gouaffo, Albert (2019): *Koloniale Verbindungen – Transkulturelle Erinnerungstopografien. Das Rheinland in Deutschland und das Grasland Kamerun*, Bielefeld; Zimmer, Jürgen; Todzi, Sebastian (Eds): *Hamburg. Tor zur kolonialen Welt. Erinnerungsorte der (post)kolonialen Globalisierung*, Hamburg 2023.
- 2 Zuschlag, Christoph (2022): *Einführung in die Provenienzforschung. Wie die Herkunft von Kulturgut entschlüsselt wird*, München; Förster, Larissa (2023): "Provenance", in: Mairesse, François (Ed.): *Dictionary of Museology*, ICOM, pp. 463–467.
- 3 For the wealth of literature addressing provenance research on cultural goods seized by the Nazis see the overview in Zuschlag, 2022, *Einführung in die Provenienzforschung*; for recent literature about provenance research in colonial contexts see the contributions in German Museums Association (Ed.) (2021): *Guidelines for the Care of Collections from Colonial Contexts*; one of the first volumes addressing both contexts is Brandstetter, Anna-Maria; Hierholzer, Vera (2018) (Eds): *Nicht nur Raubkunst! Sensible Dinge in Museen und universitären Sammlungen*, Mainz; Förster, Larissa: "Der Umgang mit der Kolonialzeit. Provenienz und Rückgabe", in: Edenheiser; Förster, 2019, *Museumsethnologie*, pp. 98–103; Heumann, Ina; Stoecker, Holger et al. (2018) (Eds): *Dinosaurierfragmente. Zur Geschichte der Tendaguru-Expedition und ihrer Objekte 1906–2018*, Göttingen.
- 4 Förster, Larissa, Iris Eidenheiser, Sarah Fründt, Heike Hartmann (Eds): *Provenienzforschung zu ethnographischen Sammlungen der Kolonialzeit. Positionen in der aktuellen Debatte. Elektronische Publikation zur Tagung „Provenienzforschung in ethnologischen Sammlungen der Kolonialzeit“*, Museum Fünf Kontinente, München, 7./8. April 2017. See also the conference on *Sensitive Heritage – Ethnographic Museums and Material/Immaterial Restitutions*, Grassi Museum für Völkerkunde zu Leipzig, 12–13 December 2018.
- 5 Sarr, Felwine; Savoy, Bénédicte (2018): *The Restitution of African Cultural Heritage: Towards a New Relational Ethics*, http://restitutionreport2018.com/sarr_savoy_en.pdf, accessed 10 May 2023. Savoy, Bénédicte (2022): *Africa's Struggle for Its Art: History of a Postcolonial Defeat*, Princeton. Gissibl, Bernhard (2019): "Everything in its Right Place? The Macron Moment and the Complexities of Restituting Africa's Cultural Heritage", *European History Yearbook*, Vol. 20, pp. 177–209.
- 6 German Museums Association, 2021, *Guidelines for the Care of Collections from Colonial Contexts*; the "Framework Principles for Dealing with Collections from Colonial Contexts"; *Framework Principles for Dealing with Collections from Colonial Contexts* on <https://www.auswaertiges-amt.de/blob/2210152/b2731f8b59210c77c68177cdcd3d03de/190412-stm-m-sammlungsgut-kolonial-kontext-en-data.pdf>, accessed 5 May 2023.
- 7 Deutscher Kulturrat (20 February 2019), *Vorschläge zum Umgang mit Sammlungsgut aus kolonialen Kontexten. Stellungnahme des Deutschen Kulturrates*, <https://www.kulturrat.de/positionen/vorschlaege-zum-umgang-mit-sammlungsgut-aus-kolonialen-kontexten/>, accessed 20 June 2023.
- 8 See German Lost Art Foundation, Magdeburg/ Berlin, *Project Funding for Cultural Goods from Colonial Contexts*, <https://www.kulturgutverluste.de/Webs/EN/ResearchFunding/Cultural->

- Goods-from-Colonial-Contexts/Index.html. See also <https://www.cp3c.org/>; <https://www.cp3c.org/3-road-strategy/>. <https://www.cp3c.org/benin-bronzes/>. About Declaration see *Joint Declaration on the Return of the Benin Bronzes*, 22 June 2022, on <https://www.bundesregierung.de/resource/blob/974430/2059172/6d587c95c56499eaa385ba6d35bb720b/2022-07-01-joint-declaration-benin-bronzes-data.pdf?download=1>, all accessed 10 May 2023.
- 9 See <https://ccc.deutsche-digitale-bibliothek.de/?lang=de>, accessed 10 May 2023.
 - 10 On trends in different countries, see the case studies in the excellent thematic issue of the Santander Art and Culture Law Review edited by Evelien Campfens and Surabhi Ranganathan on Switzerland, Suriname, Scotland, the Netherlands, Indonesia, Germany, France, England, Belgium. On the examples cited, see: Advisory Committee on the National Policy Framework for Colonial Collections, Council for Culture (Eds) (2022): *Guidance on the Way Forward for Colonial Collections: A Recognition of Injustice*, Den Haag, <https://www.raadvoorcultuur.nl/binaries/raadvoorcultuur/documenten/adviezen/2020/10/07/summary-of-report-advisory-committee-on-the-national-policy-framework-for-colonial-collections/Summary+of+report+Advisory+Committee+on+the+National+Policy+Framework+for+Colonial+Collections.pdf>; *Restitution Belgium: Ethical Principles for the Management and Restitution of Colonial Collections*, <https://restitutionbelgium.be/en/report>; Stefan Weiss (2022): "Koloniale Kulturgüter. Österreich richtet Expertengremium ein", in: *Der Standard*, 20 January 2022, <https://www.derstandard.de/story/2000132682271/koloniale-kulturgueter-oesterreich-richtet-expertengremium-ein>; „Restitution. Wie Österreich künftig mit kolonialen Objekten umgehen will“, on *nachrichten.at*, 01.06.2023, <https://www.nachrichten.at/kultur/restitution-wie-oesterreich-kuenftig-mit-kolonialen-objekten-umgehen-will;art16,3849531>, all accessed 20 June 2023.
 - 11 See <https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/transfer/index>, accessed 20 June 2023.
 - 12 Members of the network include museums and universities as well as partners from libraries, archives and regional associations. Essential tasks are, among others, counselling museums in the area of provenance research, creating initiatives for research and collaborative projects, providing support with applications for funding, helping with the organisation of information, further education events, and public relations work. See <https://www.provenienzforschung-niedersachsen.de/>, accessed 20 June 2023. The coordination office of the network is based at the Lower Saxony State Museum of Hanover. First results of provenance research on collections from colonial contexts were presented at the exhibition *A Difficult Legacy – Remnants of Colonialism until Today*, Lower Saxony State Museum Hanover, 2016/17. See von Poser, Alexis; Baumann, Bianca (2016): *Heikles Erbe. Koloniale Spuren bis in die Gegenwart*, Dresden.
 - 13 Andratschke, Claudia (2016): "Provenienzforschung in ethnologischen Sammlungen", in: von Poser; Baumann, 2016, *Heikles Erbe*, pp. 304–30; Andratschke, Claudia (2017): "Provenienzforschung in ethnologischen Sammlungen. Umgang mit einem heiklen Erbe", in: *Studia Instituti Missiologici Societatis Verbi Divini*, pp. 65–76; Andratschke, Claudia (2018): "Netzwerke erweitern – Von NS-Raubgutforschung zur Provenienzforschung in ethnologischen Sammlungen der Kolonialzeit", in: Förster et al., 2018, *Provenienzforschung zu ethnografischen Sammlungen der Kolonialzeit*, pp. 295–310.
 - 14 See e.g. Lang, Sabine; Nicklisch, Andrea (2021): *Den Sammlern auf der Spur. Provenienzforschung zu kolonialen Kontexten am Roemer- und Pelizaeus- Museum Hildesheim 2017/18*, Heidelberg: art-historicum.net.
 - 15 This has also been emphasised by Förster, Larissa (2016): "Plea for a More Systematic, Comparative, International and Long-Term Approach to Restitution, Provenance Research and the Historiography of Collections", in: *Museumskunde*, Vol. 81, pp. 49–54.
 - 16 When the project finally started in 2018, there were already cooperation projects between universities, museums and countries of origin, as in Berlin or Stuttgart, but not on this scale. See the contributions in Förster et al., 2018, *Provenienzforschung zu ethnografischen Sammlungen der Kolonialzeit*.

- 17 See Andratschke, Claudia; Müller, Lars (2019): "Projektstart PAESE – Provenienzforschung in außereuropäischen Sammlungen und der Ethnologie in Niedersachsen", in: *museums:zeit*, p. 53. <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/>, accessed 20 June 2023.
- 18 See Stieglitz, Hannah (2022): "Koloniales Wissen aus der Kiste. Albert Peters Sammelreisen im kolonisierten Ostafrika", in: Allemeyer, Marie Luisa; Joachim Baur und Christian Vogel (Ed.): *Räume des Wissens. Die Basisausstellung im Forum Wissen Göttingen*, Göttingen, pp. 250–253.
- 19 See Tadge, Jennifer (2020): "Conchyliologische Kenntnisse erwünscht...", on: *Retour. Freier Blog für Provenienzforschende*, 8 April 2020; Tadge, Jennifer (2019): "Beginn des PAESE-Projekts zur Erforschung kolonialer Sammlungsbestände", in: *Museum Journal Natur und Mensch*, Vol. 10, pp. 43–46; Tadge, Jennifer (2020): „Vom Scheitel bis zur Sohle. Provenienzforschung am Landesmuseum Natur und Mensch Oldenburg“, in: *Museumskunde*, Vol. 2, pp. 26–29.
- 20 Clifford, James (1997): "Museums as Contact Zones", in: Clifford, James (Ed.): *Routes. Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*, Cambridge, pp. 188–219.
- 21 Boast, Robin (2011): "Neocolonial Collaboration: Museum as Contact Zone Revisited", in: *Museum Anthropology*, Vol. 34, no. 1, pp. 56–70.
- 22 For museum cooperations see especially Laely, Thomas; Meyer, Marc; Schwere, Raphael (2018) (Eds): *Museum Cooperation between Africa and Europe: A New Field for Museum Studies*, Bielefeld. For postcolonial provenance research see especially Weber-Sinn, Kristin; Ivanov, Paola (2018): "Shared Research – Zur Notwendigkeit einer kooperativen Provenienzforschung am Beispiel der Tansania-Projekte am Ethnologischen Museum Berlin", in: Förster et al., 2018, *Provenienzforschung zu ethnografischen Sammlungen der Kolonialzeit*, pp. 143–156; Weber-Sinn, Kristin; Ivanov, Paola (2020): "'Collaborative' Provenance Research: About the (Im)possibility of Smashing Colonial Frameworks", in: *Museum and Society*, Vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 66–81; see also the blog post Ilja Labischinski (2020): "We talk, you listen! Anregungen zu einer Diskussion über Möglichkeiten und Grenzen der Zusammenarbeit mit Stakeholdern aus Herkunftsgesellschaften", on: Boasblog, 7 April 2020, <https://boasblogs.org/de/dcntr/we-talk-you-listen/>, accessed 20 June 2023; Scholz, Andrea (2019): "Transkulturelle Zusammenarbeit in der Museumspraxis. Symbolpolitik oder epistemologische Pluralisierung?", in: Förster; Edenheiser, 2019, *Museumsethnologie*, pp. 162–179.
- 23 See <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/paese-dzk-workshop-2019/>, accessed 21 June 2023; Interview Larissa Förster and Lars Müller with Tebuho Winnie Kanyimba, Ndzodo Awono, Tommy Yaulin Buga, Drossilia Dikegue Igouwe, Richard Tsogang Fossi (2020): "Challenges of Transnational Cooperation. A Discussion with Researchers from the Global South", in: *Provenienz & Forschung*, Vol. 2, pp. 37–43.
- 24 Panel 54: Chair Lars Müller, Paper I: Isabella Bozsa, Bianca Baumann: *Cooperation as Method*, Paper II: Julia Binter, Golda Ha-Eiros: *Challenging Narratives about Africa through Collaborative Provenance Research: The Case of the Namibian Collections at the Ethnologisches Museum Berlin*, Paper III: Syowia Kyambi, Mareike Späth: *Absurdity@Amani. The Joys of Joint Artistic and Ethnographic Explorations of a Colonial Collection*, 10.06.2021, further information: <https://vad-africachallenges.de/panel/p-54-opportunities-and-challenges-of-cooperative-provenance-research/>, accessed 20 June 2023.
- 25 The pandemic also had a major impact on our research trips; the stay in Tanzania had to be shortened; two employees had to be brought back with the return action of the German Foreign Office. The trip to Australia was complicated by quarantine regulations. Invitations were not possible for a certain period of time and then only with great hurdles. The pandemic thus had a massive impact on our work. See also the field report: Bianca Baumann, Isabella Bozsa (2020), "Between Hysteria, Xenophobia and Well-Meant Advice: Two German Provenance Researchers in Cameroon During the Corona Crisis", on: *Retour. Freier Blog für Provenienzforschende*.
- 26 See e. g. the discussion in cooperation with the NDR "Museumsdetektive – Auf den Spuren des kolonialen Erbes im Norden" at the Lower Saxony State Museum Hanover, 13 September 2019, with

- Larissa Förster (German Lost Art Foundation), Albert Gouaffo (Caméroun-Université de Dschang, Cameroon), Flower Manase (Curator, National Museum of Tanzania, Daressalam), Nzila M. Libanda-Mubusisi (Curator, National Museum of Namibia, Windhoek), Michael Kraus (Curator, Ethnographic Collections, Georg-August-Universität Göttingen), Translator: Bernd Leinenbach. See e.g. the podium discussion "Woher kommst Du? Einblicke in die Provenienzforschung" in the series *Forschung made in Niedersachsen* run by the Lower Saxony Ministry of Science and Culture, 28 May 2019. See, <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/Flyer-Programm-Hannover-2019-09-13.pdf>, last accessed 20 June 2023; Podiumsgespräch/Webinar: *Aufarbeitung – Rückgabe – Verantwortung: Wie geht Niedersachsen mit seinem kolonialen Erbe um?*, 25 September 2020; "Die Vergangenheit in der Gegenwart – Post/Kolonialismus in der Lehre" (Lecture series *Alle Gleich Anders!? – Diversity in Theorie und Praxis*). Institut für Diversitätsforschung, Georg-August-Universität Göttingen, 11 June 2021. On the interviews see: "Studentische Stimmen zu Objekten der Kamerun-Sammlungen im Städtischen Museum Braunschweig und im Landesmuseum Hannover", 9–10 March 2020, Institut des Beaux-Arts of the University of Duala, Nkongsamba, <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/videstatement-contested-heritage/>, last accessed 20 June 2023.
- 27 Bianca Baumann and Isabella Bozsa not only conducted a workshop at Chefferie Sodiko (7 March 2020), but also another in collaboration with Rachel Mariembe from the Institut des Beaux-Arts of the University of Duala (<https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/workshop-contested-heritage/>; <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/workshop-sodiko/>). See also *Cooperation Cameroun-Allemagne «1500 Objets D'Arts du Cameroun au Musee National De Hanovre En All.» Débats internationaux sur la provenance des biens culturels issus de contexte s coloniaux Atelier Interdisciplinaire Sur Les Biens Coloniaux et la Cooperation Avec Les Chefferies Traditionnelles*. Rachel Mariembe, Isabella Bozsa, Bianca Baumann (2020): "Voices of Students on a Contested Heritage: Workshop on Provenance Research at the Institute of Fine Arts of the University of Douala in Nkongsamba", 9–10 March 2020, on: *Retour. Freier Blog für Provenienzforschende*, 19 May 2020, accessed 20 June 2023.
- 28 See the contributions by Rainer Hatoum, Werner Hillebrecht and Frederick Nguvauva in this volume; see also Christiane Habermalz (2020): "Der Gürtel des Kahimemua", in: *FAZ*, 19 February 2020.
- 29 See *Press Release Royal Visit from Cameroon at the Municipal Museum of Brunswick*, City of Braunschweig, <https://www.braunschweig.de/kultur/museen/staedtisches-museum/artikelpool-dauerhaft/bangwa-besuch-englisch.php>. For the context of this case see Campfens, Evelien; Bozsa, Isabella (2022): "Provenance Research and Claims to Bangwa Collections: A Matter of Morality or Justice?", *VerfBlog*, <https://verfassungsblog.de/provenance-research-and-claims-to-bangwa-collections/>, all accessed 29 June 2023.
- 30 See e.g. "Öffnet die Inventare! Ein Appell, das vorhandene Wissen zu afrikanischen Objekten in deutschen Museen endlich frei zugänglich zu machen", in: *Die ZEIT*, 17 October 2019, p. 64.
- 31 See <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/database/?lang=en>, accessed 20 June 2023.
- 32 See e. g. Scholz, Andrea; Costa Oliveira, Thago da; Dörk, Marian: "Infrastructure as Digital Tools and Knowledge Practices: Connecting the Ethnologisches Museum Berlin with Amazonia Indigenous Communities", in: Hahn et al. (Eds): *Digitalisierung ethnologischer Sammlungen*, 299–315, and the book Hahn, Hans-Peter; Lueb, Oliver; Müller, Katja; Noack, Karoline (Eds): *Digitalisierung ethnologischer Sammlungen. Perspektiven aus Theorie und Praxis*, Bielefeld.
- 33 See Andratschke, Claudia; Müller, Lars (2021): *Introduction to the PAESE Database*, https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/wp-content/uploads/2023/07/PAESE-Database_Introduction_EN.pdf; Müller, Lars (2020): "Herausforderungen und Möglichkeiten von Datenbanken in der postkolonialen Provenienzforschung. Ein Praxisbericht aus dem PAESE-Projekt", in: *Provenienz & Forschung*, Vol. 2, pp. 52–57; Andratschke, Claudia; Müller, Lars (2021): "Dokumentation im Dialog. Die PAESE-Datenbank zur Provenienzforschung zu Sammlungsgut aus kolonialen Kontexten", in:

- Hahn, Hans-Peter; Lueb, Oliver; Müller, Katja; Noack, Karoline (Eds): *Digitalisierung ethnologischer Sammlungen. Perspektiven aus Theorie und Praxis*, Bielefeld, pp. 239–260; Andratschke, Claudia; Müller, Lars (2022): "Haltungen im Verbund entwickeln – ein Einblick in Aushandlungs- und Abstimmungsprozesse im Zusammenhang mit der PAESE-Datenbank", on: *Sensible Objekte – Sensible Daten*, <https://sensdat.hypotheses.org/724>, 19 May 2022, all accessed 20 June 2023.
- 34 See most recently also Sprute, Sebastian-Manès (2023): "Chaos im Museum. Bestandsaufnahme und Wissensordnung", in: Assilkinga, Mikaél et al.: *Atlas der Abwesenheit. Kameruns Kulturerbe in Deutschland*, Heidelberg: arthistoricum.net, pp. 265–295.
- 35 We would like to express our sincere thanks for the following presentations which were not possible to transfer into a book chapter format: Sara Müller (Göttingen) on *Traces of the Sepik Expedition in Institutions of the Global North*, Tommy Y. Buga (National Museum PNG) with *Insights into Museum Practices at the National Museum and Art Gallery PNG*, Nelson Adebo Abiti (National Museum Uganda) on *Ethnography and Natural History and the question Whose Idea and What Do They Mean in Museums*, Miranda Lowe (London) on *Re-activating the Silenced Landscapes of Natural History Collections*, Shaun Angelis on *Living in their Hands: The International Repatriation of Sensitive and Restricted Men's Objects to Australia*, Matthias Goldmann on *Imperial Law's Ambiguity*. The speed with which developments in this field are taking place is shown above all by the contribution of Sylvie Vernyuy Njobati (*A People's Identity in Captive – The Continuous Ruins of German Colonial Rule in Present Day on the Nso People*) in which she makes a restitution claim for the Ngonnso', which is currently held in the Ethnological Museum (SPK) in Berlin. At the conference, an evasive statement by the museum about "Object No. III C 15017" was read, but in 2022 the Foundation Board cleared the way for a return. Two comments were given at the conference during Section I by Alexis von Poser and Oswald Masebo. See the conference booklet with abstracts of all papers on <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/conference/>; Press Release SPK (27 June 2022), *Stiftungsrat macht Weg für die Rückkehr der Ngonnso' nach Kamerun frei*, <https://www.preussischer-kulturbesitz.de/pressemitteilung/artikel/2022/06/27/stiftungsrat-macht-weg-fuer-die-rueckkehr-der-ngonnso-nach-kamerun-frei.html>, accessed 20 June 2023. For updates on the case, see @sylvienjabati on Twitter.
- 36 See also Gouaffo, Albert (2023): "Plädoyer für eine dekoloniale Sprache im Museum", in: Assilkinga et al., 2023, *Atlas der Abwesenheit*, pp. 299–312.
- 37 Finally, the PAESE project was a starting point for the institutions and people involved and many new projects have already emerged or are planned at the moment. The Ministry for Science and Culture in Lower Saxony, for instance, has funded the five PAESE facilities to prepare a new joint project for the digitisation of their South Pacific holdings.
- 38 There were or are several projects in Lower Saxony, e.g. in East Frisia, Alfeld or Stade, whose results are also documented or have already been documented in the PAESE database. See Andratschke, Claudia; Jachens, Maik (2022): "Transparenz durch Digitalisierung. Sammlungsgut aus kolonialen Kontexten in Niedersachsen", in: *museums.zeit*, pp. 19–20; for a project in East Frisia researching collections from Quingdao, China, see Andratschke, Claudia; Jachens, Maik (2023) (Eds): *Sammlungsgut aus kolonialen Kontexten (China) in vier ostfriesischen Museen und Kultureinrichtungen*, Heidelberg: arthistoricum.net. In Alfeld the international animal trade of C. Reiche and C. Ruhe is at the focus of a project since 2021, see Andratschke, Claudia; Müller, Lars: (2021): "'Menschen, Tiere und leblose Gegenstände'. Die Alfelder Tierhändler Reiche und Ruhe als Ausstatter von Völkerschauen", in: Frühsorge, Lars; Riehn, Sonja; Schütte, Michael (Eds): *Völkerschau-Objekte*, Lübeck, pp. 131–143; the project at the University of Göttingen: <https://www.uni-goettingen.de/en/659291.html>. The Museum in Stade started a project about the Karl Braun collection and his role in Amani, Tanzania, see; <https://www.museen-stade.de/schwedenspeicher/service/forschung/sammlung-karl-braun/>; all accessed 20 June 2023.

- 39 See <https://www.kulturstiftung.de/introducing-an-extensive-digital-public-repository-of-collections-from-colonial-contexts-in-germany/>, accessed 20 June 2023.
- 40 On Kenya, see *Invisible Inventories Programme*, <https://www.inventoriesprogramme.org/exhibition>; on Benin see <https://digitalbenin.org/>; on Namibia see Förster, Larissa: *Online Guidebook and Inventory of Namibian Cultural Heritage in Museums and University Collections in German-Speaking Countries. An Initiative of the German Lost Art Foundation*, May 2022; On Cameroon, see Assilkinga et al., 2023, *Atlas der Abwesenheit*. See also *Digital Pasifik* on <https://digitalpasifik.org/>; and the project *Reanimating Cultural Heritage: Digital Repatriation, Knowledge Networks and Civil Society Strengthening in Post-Conflict Sierra Leone*, <https://www.sierraleoneheritage.org/>, all accessed 20 June 2023.
- 41 Next to repositoria there are also some working papers that provide overviews of demands or cases of restitution and that structure information about collections with another focus, see Moiloa, Molemo (2022): "Reclaiming Restitution: Centring and Contextualizing the African Narrative", *Open Restitution Africa*. The issue "Reclaiming our Cultural Heritage", *Jahazi: Culture, Arts, Performance*, Vol. 10, Issue 1, 2022. Müller, Lars (2021): *Returns of Cultural Artefacts and Human Remains in a (Post)colonial Context: Mapping Claims between the mid-19th Century and the 1970s*. Working Paper German Lost Art Foundation 1; Gram, Rikke; Schoofs, Zoe (2022): *Germany's History of Returning Human Remains and Objects from Colonial Contexts: An Overview of Successful Cases and Unsettled Claims between 1970 and 2021*. Working Paper German Lost Art Foundation, 3; Künkler, Eva (2022): *Koloniale Gewalt in Deutsch-Neuguinea und der Raub kultureller Objekte und menschlicher Überreste. Eine systematische Übersicht zu Militärgewalt und sogenannten Strafexpeditionen in deutschen Kolonialgebieten in Ozeanien (1884–1914)*. Working Paper German Lost Art Foundation 4; Decoloniale Berlin (2022): *We Want Them Back. Wissenschaftliches Gutachten zum Bestand menschlicher Überreste/Human Remains aus kolonialen Kontexten in Berlin, Berlin*.
- 42 The Ethnographic Collection of the University of Göttingen had several projects addressing provenance research on sensitive collections like Tjurunga, see <https://www.uni-goettingen.de/de/dritt-mittelprojekte/637096.html>. At the *Landesmuseum Natur und Mensch Oldenburg* the provenance of a Benin object has been researched, see <https://www.naturundmensch.de/themen/provenienzforschung>. The *Roemer- und Pelizaeus Museum Hildesheim* started a project about collections from China in 2022, see <https://www.rpmuseum.de/de/museum/projekte/provenienzforschung.html>, all accessed 20 June 2023.
- 43 *Heavyweight Fashion: Traditional Clothing and Adornment of Herero Women*. Exhibition at the *Roemer- und Pelizaeus-Museum Hildesheim*, 11 February 2020 – 31 January 2021. As an example of how, through the PAESE project, the collections in Hildesheim and Göttingen worked more closely together, see the exhibition: *Souvenirs aus Neuguinea? Die Sammlung des Ingenieurs Hermann Großkopf* (Souvenirs from New Guinea? The Collection of Engineer Hermann Großkopf), 13 August 2021, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sGNvB5-1dpc>. For the exhibition in Hanover see <https://www.landmuseum-hannover.de/program/perspektivwechsel/>, both accessed 10 May 2023. For the new permanent exhibition at the Municipal Museum in Brunswick see <https://www.braunschweig.de/kultur/museen/staedtisches-museum/artikelpool-dauerhaft/aa-dauerausstellung-haus-am-loewenwall.php>, accessed 29 September 2023.
- 44 For further information see, <https://www.postcolonial-provenance-research.com/>, accessed 10 May 2023.